BEFORE THE ARIZONA STATE BOARD OF TECHNICAL REGISTRATION

In the Matter of:

STEVEN O'BRIEN, P.E.

Holder of Professional Engineer License # 35209 (Mechanical)

Respondent.

OAH Docket No. 20F-P16-066-BTR BTR Case No. P16-066

CONSENT AGREEMENT AND ORDER OF DISCIPLINE

In the interest of a prompt and judicious resolution of the above-captioned matters before the Arizona State Board of Technical Registration (the "Board") and consistent with the public interest, statutory requirements, and the responsibilities of the Board, and pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes ("A.R.S.") § 32-101, et seq. and Arizona Administrative Code ("A.A.C.") R4-30-120(G), the undersigned party, Steven O'Brien ("Respondent"), holder of Registration No. 35209, and the Board enter into the following Recitals, Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Order ("Consent Agreement") as a final disposition of this matter.

I. RECITALS

- 1. The Board has not conducted a hearing nor made a determination on the merits contained herein. Instead, the Board and Respondent have agreed to a full and final settlement of this matter in lieu of formal disciplinary proceedings, pursuant to A.A.C. R4-30-123(B).
- 2. Respondent has read and understands this Consent Agreement and has had the opportunity to discuss this Consent Agreement with an attorney, or has waived the opportunity to discuss this Consent Agreement with an attorney.
- 3. Respondent understands that he has a right to a public administrative hearing concerning this case. He further acknowledges that at such formal hearing he could present evidence and cross-examine witnesses. By entering into this Consent

Agreement, Respondent knowingly, voluntarily, and irrevocably waives his right to such an administrative hearing, as well as rights of rehearing, review, reconsideration, appeal, judicial review or any other administrative and/or judicial action concerning the matters set forth herein.

- 4. Respondent affirmatively agrees that this Consent Agreement shall be irrevocable.
- 5. Respondent understands that this Consent Agreement or any part of the agreement may be considered in any future disciplinary action by the Board against him or Respondent Firm.
- 6. The Consent Agreement, any record prepared in this matter, all investigative materials prepared or received by the Board and all related exhibits and materials, are public records (as defined in A.R.S. § 41-151.18) upon acceptance by the Board of this Consent Agreement and may be retained in the Board's files pertaining to this matter.
- 7. Respondent understands this Consent Agreement deals with Board case number P16-066 involving allegations that Respondent engaged in conduct that could subject him to discipline under the Board's statutes and rules. The investigation into these allegations against Respondents shall be concluded upon the Board's adoption of this Consent Agreement.
- 8. Respondent understands that this Consent Agreement is solely to settle case number P16-066, does not preclude the Department from instituting other proceedings as may be appropriate now or in the future, does not constitute a dismissal or resolution of any other matters currently pending before the Board, if any, and does not constitute any waiver, express or implied, of the Board's statutory authority or jurisdiction regarding any other pending or future investigation, action or proceeding.
- 9. Respondent also understands that, with respect to the conduct that is the subject of this Consent Agreement, acceptance of this Consent Agreement does not preclude any other agency, subdivision, or officer of this State from instituting any other

civil or criminal proceedings, investigating claims, or taking legal action as may be appropriate now or in the future relating to this matter or other matters concerning Respondent, including but not limited to violations of Arizona's Consumer Fraud Act. Respondent acknowledges that, other than with respect to the Board, this Consent Agreement makes no representations, implied or otherwise, about the views or intended actions of any other state agency or officer or political subdivision of the state relating to this matter or other matters concerning Respondent.

- 10. All admissions made by Respondent in this Consent Agreement and Order of Discipline are solely for final disposition of case number P16-066 and any subsequent related administrative or enforcement proceedings or civil litigation involving the Board and Respondent in case number P16-066. Therefore, said admissions by Respondent are not intended or made for any other use, such as in the context of another state or federal government regulatory agency proceeding, civil or criminal court proceeding, in the State of Arizona or any other state or federal court.
- Agreement and returning this document to the Board's Executive Director, he may not revoke his acceptance of the Consent Agreement or make any modifications to the document regardless of whether the Consent Agreement has been signed on behalf of the Board. Any modification to this original document is ineffective and void unless mutually agreed by the parties in writing.
- 12. This Consent Agreement is subject to the approval of the Board and is effective only when accepted by the Board and signed on behalf of the Board. If the Board does not accept this Consent Agreement, the Board retains its authority to hold a formal administrative hearing pursuant to A.R.S. § 32-128(D). In the event that the Board does not approve this Consent Agreement, it is withdrawn, shall be of no evidentiary value, and shall not be relied upon nor introduced in any action by any party. Respondent agrees that should the Board reject this Consent Agreement and this case

proceeds to hearing, Respondent shall assert no claim that the Board was prejudiced by its review and discussion of this document or any records relating thereto.

- 13. If a court of competent jurisdiction rules that any part of this Consent Agreement is void or otherwise unenforceable, the remainder of the Consent Agreement shall remain in full force and effect.
- 14. Respondent agrees that any violation of this Consent Agreement may result in disciplinary action.
- 15. Respondent agrees that the Board will adopt the following Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Order.

II. FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. The Board is the duly constituted authority for the regulation and control of the practice of engineering in the State of Arizona.
- 2. Respondent is the holder of Professional Engineer License # 35209, for Mechanical Engineering.
- 3. In or around 2010, MTM Construction, Inc. entered into a contract with Bridgers & Paxton Consulting Engineers ("Bridgers and Paxton") to provide Mechanical and Electrical Engineering consultation for energy conservation measures ("ECMs") at the Carl T. Hayden Phoenix VA Medical Center (the "Center").
- 4. Respondent was employed as a mechanical engineer with Bridgers and Paxton, and was assigned to design ECMs for the Center's chilled water storage project (the "Project").
- 5. On or about May 4, 2016, Board staff received a complaint alleging that Respondent failed to apply appropriate technical knowledge and skill in designing the Project.
- 6. On December 1, 2016, the Board's Enforcement Advisory Committee ("EAC") convened to review the complaint against Respondent. As a result of the December, 2016, meeting, the EAC concluded that Respondent failed to apply the appropriate technical knowledge and skill in his design of the Project.

- 7. Respondent requested that a second EAC meeting be convened in order to present additional material to the EAC. The second EAC meeting was held on April 11, 2017. As a result of the April, 2017, meeting, the EAC concluded that Respondent failed to apply the appropriate technical knowledge and skill in his design of the Project.
- 8. Respondent's lack of technical knowledge and skill with regard to the Project is demonstrated by the following failures:
 - a. Respondent did not properly inform his client that the design parameters would not meet the agreed-upon project requirements without continued upgrades at the VA campus;
 - Respondent did not change the size of the pump for the chilled water tank
 when the VA changed the discharge time from twelve to ten hours after a
 rate change with APS;
 - c. Respondent did not properly document his design in at least two instances; and
 - d. Respondent failed to properly document changes on plans reflecting a change in the sequence of operation necessary to meet ECM requirements utilizing the chilled water tank.
- 9. In or around 2011, Respondent signed and sealed two professional documents for the Project that had the same seal date, drawing date and same revision number, although the sequence of operation was modified in the second document, and the modifications were not indicated with revision clouds. These changes were material to how the system performed.

III. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. The Board has jurisdiction in this matter pursuant to A.R.S. § 32-101, et seq.
- 2. The conduct alleged in the Findings of Fact, constitutes grounds for discipline pursuant to A.R.S. § 32-128(C)(4) (violation of Board rules) as it relates to

 A.A.C. R4-30-301(6), in that Respondent failed to apply appropriate knowledge and skill in his design of the Project.

IV. ORDER

Based on the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, the Board issues the following Order:

- 1. STAYED SUSPENSION AND PROBATION. Respondent's registration as Mechanical Engineer No. 35209, shall be suspended for twelve (12) months from the effective date of this Consent Agreement; however, the suspension is stayed for as long as Respondent remains in compliance with this Order. During the stay of suspension, Respondent's registration as a Professional 35209 is placed on probation for twelve (12) months. If Respondent is non-compliant with any terms of this Order during the twelve (12) month stayed suspension and probation period, the stay of the suspension shall be lifted and Respondent's registration as a Professional Engineer shall be automatically suspended without a formal hearing, and remain suspended until Respondent is compliant with all terms of this Order. If Respondent completes all terms of this Order prior to the twelve (12) month stayed suspension and probation period, Respondent may seek an early termination of this Order by requesting a formal review by the Board. The Board may also consider Respondent's non-compliance with this Order as a separate violation of A.R.S. § 32-150.
- 2. PEER REVIEW. Respondent shall submit his next two (2) Mechanical Engineering projects for peer review. Within Thirty (30) days of the effective date of this Consent Agreement, Respondent shall furnish to the Board, the name of an Arizona registered Professional Mechanical Engineer ("Peer Reviewer") who agrees to review and report on Respondent's work. The proposed Peer Reviewer shall have at least five years of actual engagement as a Mechanical Engineer with expertise in Mechanical Engineering, shall be registered and in good standing with the Board, and shall not have received any disciplinary action from the Board within the last three years. Respondent shall submit to the Board a current resume detailing the qualifications of the proposed

Peer Reviewer, and an Affidavit and Agreement to Conduct Peer Review signed by the proposed Peer Reviewer. Upon approval by the Board of the Peer Reviewer, Respondent shall ensure that the Peer Reviewer provides a written report to the Board after each peer reviewed project describing any deficiencies in Respondent's practice, and certifying that the peer reviewed project provided to the client by the Respondent is in compliance with Board rules and statutes. Respondent shall not give final approval on any projects to a client, contractor, any regulatory or review body or any other person until the project has been reviewed and approved by the Peer Reviewer. Respondent shall retain the Peer Reviewer at his own expense.

- 3. PROFESSIONAL ETHICS CLASS. Within sixty (60) days from effective date of this Consent Agreement, Respondent shall provide verification to the Board that Respondent has successfully completed a Board approved class in professional ethics.
- 4. COST OF INVESTIGATION. Within twelve (12) months from the effective date of this Consent Agreement, Respondent shall pay the cost of investigation of this case to the Board in the amount of Two Thousand Five Hundred Dollars (\$2500.00). Payments of Two Hundred Fifty Dollars (\$250.00) for ten (10) months are to be submitted to the Board by certified check or money order made payable to the State of Arizona Board of Technical Registration, according to the provisions of A.R.S. § 32-128(H).
- 5. OBEY ALL LAWS. During the probationary period, Respondent shall obey all federal, state and local laws, as well as, all rules governing the practice of Engineering in the State of Arizona. The Board shall consider any violation of this paragraph to be a separate violation of the rules and statues governing the Arizona Board of Technical Registration. The Board may also consider Respondent's non-compliance with this Order as a separate violation of A.R.S. § 32-150.3.
- 6. RENEWAL OF REGISTRATION. During the probationary period, Respondent shall timely renew his Arizona registration as an Engineer and timely pay all required registration fees.

- 7. EFFECTIVE DATE. The effective date of this Consent Agreement is the date it was last executed by the Respondent or the Board.
- 8. COSTS OF COMPLIANCE. Respondent shall pay all costs associated with complying with this Consent Agreement.

ACCEPTED and ORDERED this 22 day of June, 2020.

ason E Foose, RLS, Chairman

Arizona State Board of Technical Registration

Consent Agreement and Order, Numbers P16-066 accepted this 1714 day of June, 2020.

Steven O'Brien, Respondent

1	ORIGINAL filed this 23 day of June, 2020, with:
2	Arizona State Board of Technical Registration 1110 W. Washington, Suite 240
3	Phoenix, AZ 85007
4	COPY of the foregoing mailed/e-mailed this 23 day of June, 2020, to:
5	
6	John L. Condrey Gordon Rees Scully Mansukhani
7	One Renaissance Square
8	Two North Central Avenue, Suite 2200 Phoenix, AZ 85004
9	jcondrey@grsm.com
10	Counsel for Respondent
11	Deanie Reh
12	deanie.reh@azag.gov Counsel for the State
13	Till
14	Bye
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	